## **HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION**

# SUBMISSION TO THE UN MID-TERM REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE 22<sup>ND</sup> SESSION OF THE UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW

# United States of America

SUBMITTED: Human Rights Educators USA (HRE USA) and University and College Consortium for Human Rights Education (UCCHRE)

CONTACT: Kristina Eberbach, HRE USA Executive Committee (kre2104@columbia.edu)

Glenn Mitoma, University and College Consortium for Human Rights Education, Co-Chair (glenn.mitoma@uconn.edu)

Felisa Tibbitts, HRE USA Advisory Board (ft2442@tc.columbia.edu)

HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATORS USA (HRE USA) IS A NATIONAL NETWORK OF OVER 700 INDIVIDUALS AND ORGANIZATIONS in the United States that promotes human rights education. The network was founded in 2012 and includes civil society organizations (CSOs), teachers and students, educational administrators, higher education faculty, the National Education Association and American Federation of Teachers, foundations, and other interested persons. HRE USA works with national and state level policy makers to integrate human rights education within curriculum frameworks and policies.

THE UNIVERSITY AND COLLEGE CONSORTIUM FOR HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION (UCCHRE) IS A NATIONAL NETWORK OF practitioners, researchers, instructors, advocates, professionals, students, administrators, alumni and

other members of the university and college communities globally that are engaged in human rights education. The Consortium was founded in 2016 and its mission is to further human rights education, research and learning by promoting engagement, collaboration, innovation, and mentorship within higher education.

#### 1. SUMMARY

- 1.1 HRE USA and UCCHRE welcome the opportunity to contribute to the Mid-Term Review of the Human Rights Council's Second Cycle Recommendations for the Universal Periodic Review of the United States of America. The focus of this submission is the implementation of human rights education (HRE) obligations by the U.S. government in higher education institutions, specifically the training of teachers, military personnel, and social workers.
- 1.2 Information for this report was gathered in 2017 through a coordinated research effort involving faculty, staff, and students at Columbia University (New York, NY) and the University of Connecticut (Storrs, CT) on behalf of HRE USA and UCCHRE.¹ Online information was reviewed for 133 higher education institutions regarding school missions and visions, courses, program requirements, learning objectives, student groups, and research centers for each school.² This information was analyzed according to whether (a) there was a direct or explicit reference to human rights; (b) there was a reference to human rights related topics such as civil liberties, social justice, humanitarian law and ethics, non-discrimination, equality, peacebuilding, and respect for human dignity; or (c) there was no reference to human rights or human rights related issues. Key findings from these studies and related literature are presented in this report.

## 2. International and National Human rights education obligations

- 2.1 There were no explicit recommendations related to human rights education in the 2<sup>nd</sup> cycle report. However, there were recommendations related to human rights education made in the 1st cycle report that the U.S. accepted, including 86, 87 and 105. Recommendation 87 was: *Incorporate human rights training and education strategies in their public policies*.
- 2.2 There is an increasing body of international human rights law on human rights education<sup>3</sup> and a growing consensus within the international community about the fundamental role of education in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Contributors include Michelle Chouinard (Institute for the Study of Human Rights, Columbia University), Kristina Eberbach (Institute for the Study of Human Rights, Columbia University, Steering Committee member for HRE USA and UCCHRE), Glenn Mitoma (Thomas J. Dodd Research Center, University of Connecticut, Steering Committee member for HRE USA and UCCHRE), Melissa Mott (Teachers College of Columbia University), Felisa Tibbitts (Teachers College of Columbia University, Advisory Board member for HRE USA), and students in the *Human Rights and Social Justice in Education* course at the University of Connecticut. This report does not represent the views of Columbia University or the University of Connecticut.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Course analysis was largely based on bulletin descriptions, when available. In most instances, course syllabi were not available online.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Article 13), Convention on the Rights of the Child (Article 29), Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (Article 10), International

the realization of human rights. The U.S. government has ratified the International Covenant on Political and Civil Rights and the Convention to Eliminate All Forms of Racial Discrimination, which have provisions related to human rights education.<sup>4</sup> Additional treaties with human rights education provisions that the U.S. government has failed to ratify include the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Further to the treaty provisions, there have been numerous General Recommendations that address the importance of HRE.<sup>5</sup>

- 2.3 The UN World Programme for Human Rights Education (WPHRE) and the UN Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training are guiding documents that set out standards for human rights education to encompass principles of peace, non-discrimination, equality, justice, tolerance, and respect for human dignity. The U.S. government has failed to report to the OHCHR on the implementation of the WPHRE since it began in 2005.
- 2.4 There is currently no comprehensive national framework or action plan on human rights education. There is neither a government focal point for Human Rights Education or a National Human Rights Institute with a mandate to provide and ensure quality human rights education.

## **KEY ISSUES**

- 3. CURRICULUM STANDARDS FOR HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION IN HIGHER EDUCATION FOR PROFESSIONAL TRAINING
- 3.1 Problem: The federal government lacks coordination, leadership, and oversight in supporting states' implementation of HRE into curricular standards in higher education for most professional training, with the exception of United States service academies which are the sole responsibility of the federal government. By virtue of our federal system, national, state and local authorities share responsibility for delivery of human rights education. However, curricular content in higher education is primarily determined at the institutional level, although professional programs leading to licensure, including social work and teacher preparation, are partially determined in response to state-

Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Article 7), International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Article 65), Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (Article 8). The Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, the most recent international human rights standard to enter into force, has a highly developed section on HRE, calling for public awareness-raising campaigns and the fostering of respect for the rights of persons with disabilities at all levels of the education system.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> On August 17, 2017, the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination spoke to the obligation of the United States as a State Party to the CERD to fulfill its obligations under Article 7 of that treaty to "adopt immediate and effective measures, particularly in the fields of teaching, education, culture and information..." Available at: <a href="http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/CERD/Pages/EarlyWarningProcedure.aspx">http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/CERD/Pages/EarlyWarningProcedure.aspx</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> For example, Comments 1 and 2 in the first set of General Comments issued by the Committee on the Rights of the Child on the General Aims of Education refer to human rights education. General Comments available at: <a href="http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/CRC/Pages/CRCIndex.aspx">http://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/CRC/Pages/CRCIndex.aspx</a>>.

mandated licensure requirements and accreditation standards set by national professional organizations. Federal service academies are the exception to this rule, as the programmatic and curricular oversight is directly controlled by the armed forces of the United States. The wide variation in curriculum endemic to higher education and the diffusion of responsibility for standards across state agencies and civil society organizations, service academies excepted, presents a challenge to coordinated HRE efforts. As a field, social work has achieved notable progress incorporating human rights into professional preparation, while teacher education and military academies incorporation is extremely limited.

- 3.2 Problem: Across higher education institutions for professional training, curriculum standards related to human rights education are disparate and unregulated. At the institutional level, few schools of social work, teacher education programs, or military academies acknowledge their responsibility to provide comprehensive human rights education to their students, although it is more likely to occur in schools of social work. Through the Council on Social Work Education, the profession includes human rights as a core competency for social workers, although few state licensure requirements reinforce this standard. The Council for Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP) does not refer to human rights in its standards for teacher preparation programs, nor do any states require competency for credentialing educators. Of the major discipline-specific professional organizations for teachers, only the National Council for the Social Studies has adopted new standards for teacher preparation that explicitly require candidates to "promote human rights through informed action in schools and/or communities," and a statement recognizing the need to incorporate HRE into primary and secondary education.<sup>6</sup> It is not clear, however, how these statements will be operationalized in teacher preparation programs, or if other professional teacher organizations will adopt similar policies. Federal service academies offer courses on military ethics and often in humanitarian law, but there is little connection made to the broader human rights framework.
- 3.3 Problem: The treatment of human rights within higher education institutions for professional trainings tends to be theoretical and international in orientation rather than practice-oriented. Schools of education include human rights primarily in their comparative and international education courses and curricula, separate from or elective for teacher preparation students. While programs providing opportunities for human rights education professional development exist in a few universities, leading programs such as the human rights education program at the University of Minnesota School of Law's Human Rights Center have been discontinued. Similarly within schools of social work it is not uncommon that human rights themes are taken up in relation to social work carried out in international settings, such as with in humanitarian emergencies.

#### **BEST PRACTICES**

3.4 Professional associations have begun to incorporate human rights into learner competencies and are thus influencing curriculum in higher education institutions. For example, the National Council of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> "National Standards for the Preparation of Social Studies Teachers. Standard 5: Professional Responsibility and Informed Action," p. 25. National Council for the Social Studies. 2018. Web. <a href="https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/media/2017/Nov/ncss">https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/media/2017/Nov/ncss</a> teacher standards 2017-rev9-6-17.pdf>.

Social Studies has adopted "National Standards for the Preparation of Social Studies Teachers" which explicitly call for social studies teacher candidates to "reflect and expand upon their social studies knowledge, inquiry skills, and civic dispositions to advance social justice and promote human rights through informed action in schools and/or communities." The NCSS Board of Directors has also specifically noted the importance of addressing the obligations of Article 7 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination to promote the principles of the UDHR in teaching and education. The Council of Social Work Education includes as a core learner competency "Advance Human Rights and Social, Economic and Environmental Justice" as a required goal for schools of social work in order to be accredited.

## 4. HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION IN INITIAL TEACHER EDUCATION

- 4.1 Problem: The vast majority of teacher training programs do not require teachers to be proficient in human rights education. Across 76 university-based teacher preparation programs in 15 states, none (0%) required human rights as part of teacher training and only 12 institutions (16%) offered students the opportunity to engage human rights content and practice. When included, HRE is almost always incorporated through initiatives of individual programs, and sometimes only individual professors, rather than comprehensive approaches. Without reinforcement from state licensure requirements or professional accreditation standards, teacher preparation rarely includes human rights teaching pedagogies, content about international human rights standards, or strategies that explicitly develop and assess student skills and values so that they learn to apply human rights principles in local, national, and global society.
- 4.2. Problem: The vast majority of training programs for other personnel who work with children and youth in schools do not contain human rights education principles and application to daily life. Social workers, psychologists, counselors, coaches, administrators, paraprofessionals, special education staff, school resource officers (i.e. police) and security staff, after-school program providers, and teaching staff licensed through alternative credential processes (such as AmeriCorps and Teach for America) work with students alongside traditional classroom teachers, and often with students requiring special supports. Training programs for such personnel may include references to social and emotional learning, restorative justice, anti-bullying, and non-discrimination, but only in rare instances explicitly link with human rights principles and their application in daily life. Additionally, many of these professionals are not trained in schools of education.

## **BEST PRACTICES**

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Ibid. p. 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> "2016 Approved Resolutions: Resolution 16-04-02 NCSS to Encourage the United States Government to Include Support for Human Rights Education In Public Schools As Part of Its Commitment to Honor Various Ratified Treaties and Approved Declarations Regarding Humans and Humanitarian Law." National Council for the Social Studies. Web. 2016. <a href="https://www.socialstudies.org/about/hod/2016resolutions#16-04-2">https://www.socialstudies.org/about/hod/2016resolutions#16-04-2</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> "Person-Centered and Participant-Directed Social Work Competencies." Council of Social Work Education, Educational Policy Accreditation Standards. Web. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="https://www.cswe.org/CMSPages/GetFile.aspx?guid=fca141d2-198c-4460-b1f1-efda64708189">https://www.cswe.org/CMSPages/GetFile.aspx?guid=fca141d2-198c-4460-b1f1-efda64708189</a>>.

- 4.3 Although a minority, some schools of education offer opportunities for teachers to develop human rights education competencies. Examples include the University of San Francisco (Master of Arts in Human Rights Education;<sup>10</sup> Human Rights Education concentration within the doctoral program in International and Multicultural Education)<sup>11</sup> and Columbia University's Teachers College (Peace and Human Rights Education concentration within the Master of Arts in International Education Development).<sup>12</sup> There are also programs housed in schools of education taking part in research and professional development on human rights education, such as the Holocaust, Genocide and Human Rights Education Project at Montclair University College of Education and Human Services<sup>13</sup> and the Center for Human Rights and International Justice at Boston College Lynch School of Education.<sup>14</sup> Beyond schools of education, a number of university-based human rights programs offer resources and opportunities for educators, including the Center for Human Rights and Peace Studies at Lehman College in New York,<sup>15</sup> the Center for the Study of Genocide and Human Rights at Rutgers University,<sup>16</sup> and the Thomas J. Dodd Research Center at the University of Connecticut.<sup>17</sup>
- 4.4 The New York State Teacher Certification Examination (Social Studies) tests prospective teachers on their understanding of seven core competencies for the social studies field, of which includes a competency titled "Civics, Citizenship, and Government". This testing requirement establishes that social studies "uses a variety of analytical and evaluative skills to demonstrate understanding of how the United States political system provides for choice and opportunities for participation, factors that have expanded or limited the role of the individual in political life in the United States, and events and developments related to the struggle for access to citizenship rights and universal human rights". 18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> "Human Rights Education Masters Program." University of San Francisco School of Education. Web. <a href="http://www.usfca.edu/soe/programs/ime/ma">http://www.usfca.edu/soe/programs/ime/ma</a> hre/>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> "International and Multicultural Ed.D. Program Details." University of San Francisco School of Education. Web. <a href="https://www.usfca.edu/education/programs/doctoral-programs/international-multicultural-education/program-details">https://www.usfca.edu/education/programs/doctoral-programs/international-multicultural-education/program-details</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> "IED Professional Specializations: Peace and Human Rights Education." Columbia University Teachers College. Web. <a href="http://www.tc.columbia.edu/international-and-transcultural-studies/international-and-comparative-education/about-us/ied-professional-specializations/">http://www.tc.columbia.edu/international-and-transcultural-studies/international-and-comparative-education/about-us/ied-professional-specializations/</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> "Holocaust, Genocide, and Human Rights Education Project." Montclair University. Web.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> "Center for Human Rights and International Justice." Boston College Lynch School of Education. Web. <a href="http://www.bc.edu/bc-web/schools/lsoe/sites/chrij/about.html">http://www.bc.edu/bc-web/schools/lsoe/sites/chrij/about.html</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> "Center for Human Rights and Peace Studies." Lehman College. Web. < <a href="http://www.lehman.edu/human-rights-peace-studies/">http://www.lehman.edu/human-rights-peace-studies/</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> "Bearing Witness: The Genocide and Human Rights Education Initiative." Rutgers University Center for the Study of Genocide and Human Rights. Web. < <a href="https://www.ncas.rutgers.edu/center-study-genocide-conflict-resolution-and-human-rights/bearing-witness-genocide-and-human-rights">https://www.ncas.rutgers.edu/center-study-genocide-conflict-resolution-and-human-rights/bearing-witness-genocide-and-human-rights</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> "Thomas J. Dodd Research Center." University of Connecticut. Web. < http://doddcenter.uconn.edu/>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> "New York State Teacher Certification Examinations Field 115: Social Studies Test Design and Framework," p. 9. New York State Education Department. Web. 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.nystce.nesinc.com/content/docs/NY115\_OBJ\_FINAL.pdf">http://www.nystce.nesinc.com/content/docs/NY115\_OBJ\_FINAL.pdf</a>.

4.5 The National Council for the Social Studies adopted the position statement "Human Rights Education: A Necessity for Effective Social and Civic Learning" calling on all members and educators to develop and advocate for "human rights education practices and programs so that all students learn to understand and value fundamental principles of human rights and to apply those principles in daily life." NCSS has also adopted "National Standards for the Preparation of Social Studies Teachers" which include as one of five core competencies that "candidates reflect and expand upon their social studies knowledge, inquiry skills, and civic dispositions to advance social justice and promote human rights through informed action in schools and/or communities." 20

## 5. HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION IN MILITARY ACADEMIES<sup>21</sup>

5.1. **Problem: Human rights-related standards are applied insufficiently and inconsistently.** The vast majority of schools do not reference human rights as part of their learning objectives or programmatic goals. The United States Air Force Academy does identify respect for human dignity, a foundational principle of human rights, as a key learning outcome. However, many of the courses that are identified by the school as ones that address this competency lack a focus on human rights or human rights-related issues. The U.S. Naval War College states that part of its mission is to provide support and expertise to the international legal community, including the study of human rights, through their Stockton Center for the Study of International Law,<sup>22</sup> however, they only offer 3 courses that focus directly on rights.<sup>23</sup> Similarly, the Naval Postgraduate School offers a Certificate in Civil Military Operations and the Rule of Law, which references respect for human rights in the certificate overview, but the descriptions of the three required courses do not explicitly reference human rights.<sup>24</sup> Several of the programs in the Naval Postgraduate School's Department of National Security Affairs also reference human rights as part of the Educational Skill Requirements,<sup>25</sup> but only two programs require

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> "Human Rights Education: A Necessity for Effective Social and Civic Learning." National Council for the Social Studies. Web. 2014. <a href="https://www.socialstudies.org/positions/human">https://www.socialstudies.org/positions/human</a> rights education 2014>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> "National Standards for the Preparation of Social Studies Teachers," p. 10. National Council for the Social Studies. Web. 2017.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/media/2017/Nov/ncss\_teacher\_standards\_2017-rev9-6-17.pdf">https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/media/2017/Nov/ncss\_teacher\_standards\_2017-rev9-6-17.pdf</a>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> This research focused on Federal Service Academies, Maritime Academies, Senior Military Colleges, Military Junior Colleges, and degree programs offered at staff colleges and other military institutions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> "2017/2018 Academic Catalog," p. 12. U.S. Naval War College. Web. 2017.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://dnnlgwick.blob.core.windows.net/portals/0/2017-2018-Academic-">http://dnnlgwick.blob.core.windows.net/portals/0/2017-2018-Academic-</a>

Catalog.pdf?sr=b&si=DNNFileManagerPolicy&sig=HE6%2ByNB1592LApM1jLJbBzLz1i2msWdTEYq03%2F7Jlic%3D>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> The bulletin also notes that the Field Studies Program, which is for international officers "provides an increased awareness of the basic issues of internationally recognized human rights" (p. 27). Program and course descriptions available at: <a href="http://dnnlgwick.blob.core.windows.net/portals/0/2017-2018-Academic-">http://dnnlgwick.blob.core.windows.net/portals/0/2017-2018-Academic-</a>

Catalog.pdf?sr=b&si=DNNFileManagerPolicy&sig=HE6%2ByNB1592LApM1jLJbBzLz1i2msWdTEYq03%2F7Jlic%3D>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> The certificate overview quotes the 2010 US National Security Strategy calling for "respect for human rights and the rule of law." Web. <a href="http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/Current/Academic-Catalog/Graduate-School-of-Business-and-Public-Policy-GSBPP/GSBPP-Programs-and-Curricula/Non-Degree-Professional-Development-">http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/Current/Academic-Catalog/Graduate-School-of-Business-and-Public-Policy-GSBPP/GSBPP-Programs-and-Curricula/Non-Degree-Professional-Development-

Programs/Certificate-in-Civil-Military-Operations-and-the-Rule-of-Law-Res-and-DL-Curriculum-215>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup>Programs in the Naval Postgraduate School Department of National Security Affairs that reference human rights as an educational skill requirement include Civil Military Relations, Combating Terrorism, Regional Security Studies

a course that focuses specifically on human rights.<sup>26</sup> Moreover, only two courses that focus directly on human rights are offered in the entire school. There is an inconsistency between the course content publicly available on the website and the stated human rights goals at these institutions.

- 5.2 **Problem: The vast majority of military academies do not integrate HRE within their curriculum.**Across the 35 academies included in this analysis, there are no academic programs, such as majors or concentrations, offered in the field of human rights studies. Only 15 schools offer at least one course that directly focuses on human rights. Of these, 8 schools offer only 1-2 human rights courses. Moreover, there are missed opportunities to incorporate human rights courses and frameworks of analysis into other related fields of study, such as peacebuilding, conflict resolution, and development studies that many schools currently offer.
  - 5.3 **Problem:** Human rights courses tend to be offered within a limited number of departments. When human rights courses are offered, they are generally offered by 1-2 academic departments, usually Political Science or Law.
  - 5.4 Problem: Most schools do not incorporate human rights into military leadership, conflict studies, law of war, and military action courses. Most schools offer courses that focus on military leadership, action, and history. While some address human rights-related issues such as just war theory, protection of civilians, and social justice, very few focus specifically on human rights. Related, many military schools offer courses that focus on WWII, the Holocaust, and Nazism, but few explicitly address the associated violations of human rights and humanitarian law.

## **BEST PRACTICES**

5.1 While no schools offer an academic program in human rights (such as a major or minor), several schools and programs articulate human rights learning outcomes. The Minor in Leadership Studies at Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University requires a course that directly focuses on human rights (Introduction to Twenty-First Century Studies).<sup>27</sup> The American Politics program at the United States Military Academy includes the ability to identify principles of civil rights and civil liberties as one of its key learning outcomes.<sup>28</sup> The United States Air Force Academy references respect for human

<sup>(4</sup> out of 8 regions), Strategic Studies, Homeland Security and Defense. Web.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/en/Current/Academic-Catalog/School-of-International-Graduate-Studies-SIGS/Department-of-National-Security-Affairs-NSA">http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/en/Current/Academic-Catalog/School-of-International-Graduate-Studies-SIGS/Department-of-National-Security-Affairs-NSA>.</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Homeland Security and Defense and the Combating Terrorism programs require NS3802 Counter-terrorism Policy in Comparative Perspective. Course description available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/Current/Academic-Catalog/Courses/NS/3000/NS3802">http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/Current/Academic-Catalog/Courses/NS/3000/NS3802</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Program description and C21S Introduction to Twenty-First Century Studies course description available at: <a href="http://www.undergradcatalog.registrar.vt.edu/1718/c21s.html">http://www.undergradcatalog.registrar.vt.edu/1718/c21s.html</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> United States Military Academy Academic Program: Class of 2018 Curriculum and Course Descriptions. "Student Learning Outcome 1(a): Identify the fundamental principles of the U.S. Constitution that influence relevant decisions - such as power, conflict, civil rights, and civil liberties - within the American political system," p. 69. Web.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="https://www.usma.edu/curriculum/SiteAssets/SitePages/Course%20Catalog/RedBook">https://www.usma.edu/curriculum/SiteAssets/SitePages/Course%20Catalog/RedBook</a> GY2018 20160608.pdf>.

dignity as one of nine overall Academy outcomes.<sup>29</sup> The Naval Postgraduate School references human rights in the description of one of its certificate programs<sup>30</sup> and mentions human rights as part of the learning outcomes for several areas of study under the Department of National Security Affairs.<sup>31</sup>

5.2 As an interdisciplinary area of study, human rights can be readily incorporated into multiple disciplines and majors. Two schools that offered human rights coursework in a greater range of departments as compared to others are (1) Virginia Military Institute, with courses in Engineering, International Studies/ Political Science, Modern Languages and Cultures, Social Sciences and (2) Virginia Polytechnic, with courses in History, Sociology, Religion and Culture, and Philosophy. Other schools that offer a human rights course in at least one department include: Judge Advocate General's Legal Center and School, Mary Baldwin University, Massachusetts Maritime Academy, National Defense University, National Intelligence University, Naval Postgraduate School, Naval War College, Norwich University, United States Air Force Academy, United States Coast Guard Academy (USCGA), United States Military Academy (USMA), United States Naval Academy (USNA), and Valley Forge Military Academy and College. The institutions that have the greatest number of courses in human rights also tend to be those that have centers, student groups, or other units on campus that were tagged as being relevant to human rights.

5.3 Most military and conflict history, action, and leadership courses neglect to address human rights. Some of the schools that do incorporate human rights into these kinds of courses include the National Defense University (Ethics and Legal Challenges of Strategic Leaders in Just and Unjust War),<sup>32</sup> Norwich University (Human Rights and Conflict in the International System),<sup>33</sup> United States Air Force Academy (War Crimes, Genocide, and Human Rights),<sup>34</sup> and United States Military Academy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> United States Air Force Academy Curriculum Handbook. "Ethics and Respect for Human Dignity Outcome Proficiency 6: USAFA graduates will be able to demonstrate professional behaviors and attitudes with others, including fair and equitable treatment of others and consideration of another person's basic human rights," p. 365. Web. 2017. <a href="https://www.usafa.edu/app/uploads/CHB.pdf">https://www.usafa.edu/app/uploads/CHB.pdf</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> The certificate overview quotes the 2010 US National Security Strategy calling for "respect for human rights and the rule of law." Web. <a href="http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/Current/Academic-Catalog/Graduate-School-of-Business-and-Public-Policy-GSBPP/GSBPP-Programs-and-Curricula/Non-Degree-Professional-Development-Programs/Certificate-in-Civil-Military-Operations-and-the-Rule-of-Law-Res-and-DL-Curriculum-215">http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/Current/Academic-Catalog/Graduate-School-of-Business-and-Public-Policy-GSBPP/GSBPP-Programs-and-Curricula/Non-Degree-Professional-Development-Programs/Certificate-in-Civil-Military-Operations-and-the-Rule-of-Law-Res-and-DL-Curriculum-215">https://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/Current/Academic-Catalog/Graduate-School-of-Business-and-Public-Policy-GSBPP/GSBPP-Programs-and-Curricula/Non-Degree-Professional-Development-Programs/Certificate-in-Civil-Military-Operations-and-the-Rule-of-Law-Res-and-DL-Curriculum-215</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> The International and Military History educational skill requirement states: "Grasp the principal causes of war in the modern era, and understand the political, technological, economic, and other influences that have governed its conduct; understand the social, political, economic, and cultural forces that have contributed to periods of stable peace; and analyze relations between states, including negotiations of peace settlements, military alliances, arms limitation agreements, economic arrangements, and human rights accords." For a complete list of programs that list International and Military History as a learning outcome, see footnote 25. Web.

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/Current/Academic-Catalog/School-of-International-Graduate-Studies-SIGS/Department-of-National-Security-Affairs-NSA/Civil-Military-Relations-Curriculum-685">http://nps.smartcatalogiq.com/Current/Academic-Catalog/School-of-International-Graduate-Studies-SIGS/Department-of-National-Security-Affairs-NSA/Civil-Military-Relations-Curriculum-685>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Course description available at: < http://www.ndu.edu/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=-y8KiVGlmHM%3d&tabid=7594&portalid=59>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> GD561 Human Rights and Conflict in the International System course description available at: <a href="https://online.norwich.edu/degree-programs/masters/master-arts-diplomacy/curriculum">https://online.norwich.edu/degree-programs/masters/master-arts-diplomacy/curriculum</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> POLS 423 War Crimes, Genocide, and Human Rights course description available at: <a href="https://www.usafa.edu/app/uploads/CHB.pdf">https://www.usafa.edu/app/uploads/CHB.pdf</a>>.

(Advanced Law of Armed Conflict).<sup>35</sup> However, human rights is often treated as one thematic issue among many in these courses. The United States Military Academy also has a Center for Holocaust and Genocide Studies that is dedicated to preventing mass atrocities.<sup>36</sup>

## 6. HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS OF SOCIAL WORK

- 6.1 Problem: The vast majority of schools of social work do not integrate HRE within their curriculum. The 2016 annual survey of the National Schools of Social Work Education was administered to 250 schools of social work in the U.S. and completed by 237. The results showed that only one school offered a Certificate in the area of Social Justice/Peace/Human Rights, the University of Pennsylvania School of Social Policy and Practice. Follow-up online research revealed however that a higher number of schools offer a concentration or coursework that address human rights.
- 6.2. **Problem: Most schools that offer HRE within their curriculum do not have a consistent and applied treatment of human rights.** Of the 22 schools studied in the online research as having some reference to human rights, 14 (64%) reference human rights in only a general way in their Mission Statement or Learner Competencies. There is no designated Coursework or Concentration. The implication is that human rights is presented as an ethical framework relevant for social work but its application in social work decision making and practices is not clarified.

#### **BEST PRACTICES**

- 6.3 Although a minority, there are schools of social work that include human rights-related concentrations. The ten schools identified are Springfield School of Social Work, New York University Silver School of Social Work, Columbia University School of Social Work, University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill School of Social Work, Fordham University Graduate School of Social Service, Rutgers University School of Social Work, University of Wisconsin School of Social Work, Temple University School of Social Work (under the auspices of the School of Public Health), University of Pennsylvania School of Social Policy and Practice and George Mason University School of Social Work.
- 6.4 An additional seven schools of social work have concentrations that are social justice oriented and offer courses and/or practicums that directly address human rights themes. The schools identified are University of Connecticut School of Social Work, Indiana University at Bloomington School of Social Work, Southern Connecticut State University Department of Social Work, the Catholic University of America National Catholic School of Social Work, Monmouth University School of Social Work, Smith University School of Social Work and the University of Michigan School of Social Work.
- 6.5 The integration of human rights within the coursework of certain schools helps to illustrate the practical dimensions of the human rights framework for social workers, specifically in ethical decision

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> LW476 Advanced Law of Armed Conflict Course description available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.usma.edu/curriculum/SiteAssets/SitePages/Course%20Catalog/RedBook GY2018 20160608.pdf">http://www.usma.edu/curriculum/SiteAssets/SitePages/Course%20Catalog/RedBook GY2018 20160608.pdf</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> "Welcome to the Center for Holocaust and Genocide Studies." United States Military Academy West Point. Web. <a href="http://www.usma.edu/chgs/SitePages/Home.aspx">http://www.usma.edu/chgs/SitePages/Home.aspx</a>.

making as well as in practice. The Fordham University Graduate School of Social Service has a Human Rights and Social Justice course where students learn a practice framework for use with individuals, families, groups, organizations, and communities that advance human rights and social and economic justice.<sup>37</sup> The Temple University School of Social Work offers a course, Social Work Research: Communities and Policy Arenas and Management/Planning, that provides students with the skills to carry out research designed to support human rights through community and/or policy assessment, planning, and intervention.<sup>38</sup> Within the University of Pennsylvania School of Social Policy and Practice, a course on International Social Work: Practices in the Global South introduces students to societal problems in the developing world and helps prepare them for overseas/cross-cultural practice. Through the course students identify numerous strategies for how to build interventions within the human rights, social welfare, education, health care and sustainable community development arenas.<sup>39</sup>

- 6.6 As of 2015, the Council on Social Work Education has as its Competency 3: Advance Human Rights and Social, Economic and Environmental Justice as a required goal for schools of social work in order to be accredited.<sup>40</sup> This competency creates an incentive for more schools of social work to integrate these principles within their education programs. The National Association of Social Workers also has a Policy on Human Rights.41
- 6.7 Scholarship related to human rights and social work is growing, including the launch of the Journal of Human Rights and Social Work.<sup>42</sup> This scholarship includes studies related to the application of human rights to social work policies and practices.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

RECOMMENDATIONS RELATING TO U.S. ENGAGEMENT WITH INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION **S**TANDARDS

1. All levels of government in the United States should immediately take steps to implement human rights education as called for in related articles of treaties that the United States has ratified.

Council of Social Work Education. Web. 2015.

<a href="https://www.cswe.org/getattachment/Accreditation/Accreditation-Process/2015-">https://www.cswe.org/getattachment/Accreditation/Accreditation-Process/2015-</a> EPAS/2015EPAS Web FINAL.pdf.aspx>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Course description available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="https://www.fordham.edu/info/20357/master">https://www.fordham.edu/info/20357/master</a> of social work/571/msw courses>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup>Course description available at: < <a href="http://bulletin.temple.edu/graduate/scd/cph-ssw/social-work-">http://bulletin.temple.edu/graduate/scd/cph-ssw/social-work-</a> msw/#courseinventory>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Course description available at: < <a href="https://www.sp2.upenn.edu/global-engagement/global-opportunities-for-sp2-">https://www.sp2.upenn.edu/global-engagement/global-opportunities-for-sp2-</a> students/courses-and-programs/>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> "2015 Educational Policy and Accreditation Standards for Baccalaureate and Master's Social Work Programs," p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> "International Policy on Human Rights." The National Association of Social Workers. Web. 2006.

<sup>&</sup>lt;https://www.socialworkers.org/assets/secured/documents/ldf/230-238International.pdf>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Journal of Human Rights and Social Work. Web. <a href="http://www.springer.com/social+sciences/journal/41134">http://www.springer.com/social+sciences/journal/41134</a>>.

- 2. The U.S. government should ratify the following treaties and comply with their human rights education provisions: the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.
- 3. The U.S. government, in cooperation with governmental and civil society stakeholders, should develop and implement a National Plan of Action for HRE, as called for in the UN World Programme for Human Rights Education (WPHRE). The Plan of Action should be developed before the mid-term review of the implementation of the recommendations following the Second Cycle of the US UPR. The Plan of Action should take into account the recommendations made for incorporating HRE within the schooling sector, including curriculum standards and the preparation of teachers, school staff and educational administrators, policy makers, and other personnel working with youth in schools. The U.S. government should make a public statement in support of human rights education by 2016 and in an ongoing manner submit reports to the OHCHR on the implementation of the WPHRE, as called for in each phase of the WPHRE.
- 4. The U.S. government should appoint a focal point for the coordination of the Plan of Action by the mid-term review to liaise with states and municipalities on an ongoing basis in identifying and developing best practices for state and local implementation of HRE. The focal point would assist state and local governments in their HRE efforts and engage in educational efforts with the public.
- 5. The U.S. government should create a National Human Rights Institute in accordance with the Paris Principles before the third UPR cycle, including a mandate to provide and ensure quality human rights education.

## RECOMMENDATIONS RELATING TO CURRICULUM STANDARDS IN HRE

- 6. The U.S. Departments of Education and State, the U.S. President, Congress, and military leaders, should encourage and support, technically and financially, state and local efforts to incorporate human rights education in legislation and departmental policies affecting higher education curriculum, professional training and licensure, and campus environment.
- 7. Human rights education should be incorporated within the curriculum standards of key fields of study in higher education, and, in particular, in the professional training of teachers, social workers, and military personnel. Human rights should be incorporated not only as a content area, but also as a critical area of practice in which professionals are required to develop competency. Given the responsibilities of teachers, social workers, and military personnel for protecting and promoting the rights of vulnerable populations, it is particularly imperative they be provided sufficient training and support in this regard. All teaching and learning materials should reflect and promote human rights values.

- 8. The U.S. government should provide support and funding for CSOs providing human rights education resources related to curriculum frameworks, with evidence of such actions by the Third Cycle.
- 9. The U.S. Department of Education should equip state and local governments to review and improve their educational policies, practices, and outcomes in order to ensure human rights education within higher education institutions.

## RECOMMENDATIONS RELATING TO INITIAL TEACHER EDUCATION

- 10. The U.S. government should work with state legislatures and credentialing agencies, as well as CSOs involved in accreditation, to ensure HRE in education programs for teachers, administrators, and other educational personnel working in schools that receive federal funding. These actions should take place before the Third Cycle of the US UPR and involve the development and dissemination of relevant standards and model programs in cooperation with educational institutions already implementing HRE and CSOs promoting HRE. The positive efforts of the National Council for the Social Studies should be supported and emulated in other fields.
- 11. The U.S. government should work with state legislatures and credentialing agencies, as well as CSOs involved in accreditation, to ensure HRE within training programs for social workers, psychologists, counselors, paraprofessionals, school resource officers and security staff, and other providers of school programming that receive federal funding by the next cycle of the US UPR, in consultation with existing HRE providers.

## RECOMMENDATIONS RELATING TO MILITARY ACADEMIES

- 12. The U.S. government should require that all those who enter military service from military schools and universities complete training in human rights and demonstrate knowledge of human rights. Military training schools should study and adapt the human rights curriculum of those military schools engaged in human rights education.
- 13. The U.S. government should provide financial, technical, policy, and educational support to (1) develop the capacity of current faculty to teach human rights; (2) recruit new faculty with expertise in human rights; (3) expand human rights course offerings, research initiatives, and other forms of human rights engagement for students, faculty, staff and other members of the learning community.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS RELATING TO SCHOOLS OF SOCIAL WORK

14. The U.S. government should work with legislatures and credentialing and accreditation entities to ensure HRE in education programs for social workers working in agencies that receive federal funding. These actions should take place before the Third Cycle of the US UPR and involve

cooperation with educational institutions already implementing HRE and civil society organizations promoting HRE. The positive experiences of schools of social work already engaged in human rights curriculum should be emulated by other schools.

15. The U.S. government should work with legislatures and credentialing and accreditation entities to ensure HRE within training programs for social workers that receive federal funding by the next cycle of the US UPR, in consultation with existing HRE providers.